

Instrumental Music Redesign
C&I Board Subcommittee Report
December 14, 2009

BACKGROUND AND HISTORY OF INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC IN NCSD#1:

- Prior to 1985, 5th and 6th grade band and orchestra students were pulled out of their core classes by instrument groups, while regular instruction continued for students not taking instrumental music. Some of the band and orchestra students were having a hard time keeping up in their core classes.
- In 1985, 5th and 6th grade instrumental music classes began running simultaneously with 5th and 6th grade general music. Students were pulled out of general music, instead of core classes.
- Instrumental Music drives creation of class schedules because instrumental teachers must schedule up to sixteen schools per week. Elementary principals must set their daily schedule based on the availability of traveling teachers.
- Most students receive 7 to 15 minutes of individual time with the teacher each session due to heterogeneous instrument groups (e.g., percussion, brass, and woodwinds meet at the same time, in the same classroom).
- NCSD used to have a music administrator who led the scheduling process, knew both content and pedagogy of instrumental, vocal and general music instruction, evaluated teachers, and supervised the hiring of music teachers.

ISSUES:

1. Space/Grade Configuration:

A. Fewer and fewer 6th graders in elementary buildings:

In 2004, the Board of Trustees adopted the recommendation of a Space/Grade IBAP to transition to a K-5, 6-8, 9-12 system of schools. Since that date, elementary schools have been decreasing their numbers of 6th grades; in 2010-2011, only six (6) schools will have approximately 167 students receiving 6th grade instruction in an elementary school; the other ~700 will receive instruction in a middle school setting.

B. Inequity of instrumental music offerings for 6th graders:

Instrumental Music in the elementary schools is offered 30 minutes twice a week (30 min. x 2 times/week x 36 weeks = 2160 minutes/year). Students who take instrumental music in the middle school receive approximately 45 minutes a day for five days a week (45 min. x 5 times/week x 36 weeks = 8100 minutes/year). The difference per year is 5040 minutes (84 hours).

2. Attrition:

- The attrition rate from one grade level to the next is high (see Appendix A).

% Drop in Instrumental Music Enrollment

<u>Grade Transition</u>	<u>% Change</u>
5th to 6th	-39%
6th to 7th	-49%
7th to 8th	-14%
8th to 9th	-36%

- Over the past 3 years 67% of 5th graders played an instrument. By 7th grade, that number dropped to 21%.
- The attrition rate seems to drop when students have the same teacher for more than one year (note small change in attrition between grade 7 and 8).

<u>Grade</u>	<u>5</u>	<u>6</u>	<u>7</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>9</u>	<u>10-12</u>
Total Instr. Enroll.	584	357	181	156	99	161
Total Student Pop.	869	860	881	900	881	2489
Percentage in Instr. Music	67%	41%	21%	17%	11%	6%

3. Efficiency and Effectiveness:

- When calculated, fully 1/3 of a teacher’s time is taken with traveling. [There are 2.8 teams of instrumental teachers who travel to elementary schools. A full-time teacher teaches up to 50 class sessions/week. A session is 30 minutes; every time teachers travel to another school a session is subtracted from the 50 possible sessions.]
- Music teachers estimate that students in elementary instrumental music classes received 7-15 minutes of time with a teacher each session due to having all instruments in one group.

PROBLEM:

What options can we bring to provide equitable opportunity for all students to receive quality music instruction? How can we most effectively and efficiently offer instrumental music to our students while honoring student and staff interests to provide an overall quality education?

OPTIONS:

- A. Background
- Paul Searcey and Scott Reinsbach were tasked with finding a solution to the problem. The original solution proposed was to no longer begin instrumental music at 5th grade and to start with 6th graders who are in middle school. When the Board of Trustees was approached with this solution, they asked for multiple options to consider.
 - The parameters around which work began included:
 - Instrumental Music cannot start earlier than 4th grade
 - Teacher drive time must be significantly reduced
 - No students should be pulled from core classes
 - Most elementary principals would like to see instrumental music early morning or late afternoon.
 - To be fiscally responsible, options must work with current staffing numbers
 - Consider scheduling limitations
 - Consider the possibility of budget cuts
 - Focus on what is best for students
 - Principals were surveyed, data were collected, and an advisory committee was formed (see Appendix B) consisting of teachers, parents, administrators, and community members.
 - At the first two meetings of the advisory committee, participants wrote pros and cons for all options. It was decided not to take the status quo option forward. Paul and Scott continued to do research on the feasibility of the remaining three plans. At the third and final meeting, two groups were asked to describe what each solution would look like at its best in five years and to analyze the gap between current practice and best practice. Each group presented one plan to the other group who asked clarifying questions.
- B. Four options were originally proposed to this committee.
- 1) **Option 1: Continue with status quo** (removed by Advisory Committee on 9/22/09)
 - 2) **Option 2: 4th grade start** (removed by C&I Board Subcommittee on 11/9/09)
 - a. Total projected cost for 4th rotating start = \$192,750 (\$135,000 in one-time costs)
 - b. Total projected cost for a 4th grade normal band/orchestra start = \$127,190 (\$71,7500 in one-time costs)
 - 3) **Option 3: 6th grade start in middle school**
 - a. Option explanation
 - i. 5th graders receive general music 2x/week for 30 minutes each.

- ii. It is intended that all 6th grade students take one Fine/Performing arts class (currently, 86% of all 6th grade students take one Fine/Performing arts class).
- iii. Offer additional “music for life classes” to reflect Music Future Search findings (see Appendix C).
- iv. Instrumental music classes in homogeneous groups (e.g., brass/woodwinds/percussion, high/low strings)
- v. Current elementary instrumental teachers move to middle school
- vi. Beginning Band/Orchestra offered to grades 6, 7, 8. (6th graders allowed into higher level classes if ready)
- vii. District music teachers work together to promote instrumental music in elementary general music classes.
- viii. Current 5th graders who are in instrumental music will be able to continue in instrumental music during their 6th grade year (2010-2011).

b. Costs

- i. 0.26 FTE to increase 5th grade general music sections (\$20,800)
- ii. 0.14 FTE/person decrease in travel for 4.8 people (-\$53,760)
- iii. District-owned elementary instruments repurposed to middle schools.
- iv. Costs for additional courses at middle level anticipated as part of budgeting process based upon course enrollment.
- v. FTE costs for additional courses come from reassigned elementary music teachers (~4.8 FTE).
- vi. **Net savings \$53,760-\$20,800 = \$32, 960 (Savings returned to music program to support more music opportunity)**

Option 3: 6th Grade Start	
Pros (+)	Cons (-)
More flexible scheduling.	No Band or Orchestra at elementary.
Anecdotal evidence from around the state and nation show that a 6th grade start is viable and successful.	Middle schools will need to find extra rooms for band and strings. Moves the problem of setting up a regular classroom for band and orchestra classes to the middle schools.
Increases time on task for students.	Middle schools dealing with traveling teachers.
Extra music classes for kids who don't want to perform.	Elementary schools retaining 6th grade will still need to be serviced by current model.
String students can use more full-sized instruments.	Strings students are able to start earlier with appropriately-sized instruments, but are not given the opportunity.
Elementary Instrumental teachers spend more time in front of students, and less behind the wheel.	Parents do not like the idea of their students missing out on the opportunity at the elementary level.
This plan can be achieved with current staff.	Additional choices may siphon off students from the instrumental classes.
Required FPA for 6th graders means no competition with other electives.	HS/MS teachers may need compensation for time spent at elementaries.
Gives core team time for collaboration.	Funding equipment for extra FPA classes.
6-12 alignment of staff and programming within regular teaching parameters.	All middle school principals must agree to this plan.
Teacher travel time significantly lessened.	Does away with successful programs at Park and FCA.
Elementary schools that retain 6th graders will still be serviced according to current model.	Does this dissuade students from taking more than one FPA course if they all happen at the same time?
Majority of 6th graders at middle school. The instruction follows the students.	Budget cuts may lead to more being placed on community partners.
Daily instruction with like-instrument settings.	
Students will not have to be bused.	
Specialty areas of teachers can be used more effectively.	
One less transition between school levels means less attrition.	

- 4) **Option 4: 5th grade start with bussing to a neighboring elementary schools; students learn in homogeneous groups**
- a. Option Explanation
- i. Band/Orchestra classes begin 5th grade (90 min/week)
 - ii. 5th grade general and instrument increase to 45 min./session x 2 sessions/week
 - iii. 5th graders bussed to nearby elementary school 1x/week
 - iv. Three teacher teams serve all elementary schools
 - v. Each teacher team includes one band and one strings
 - vi. 6th grade also offered beginning band/orchestra at middle school
 - vii. Stand alone schools (Bar Nunn, Ft. Casper, Park, Poison Spider) have heterogeneous band/orchestra sessions because of distance to a nearby school)
 - viii. District music teachers work together to promote instrumental music in elementary general music classes.
- b. Costs
- i. 0.28 FTE increase for general music additional 15 minutes/session (\$22,400)
 - ii. 1.2 FTE increase - need 3 teams (6 FTE) to cover all 22 schools in homogeneous groups. Currently use 4.8 FTE. (\$96,000)
 - iii. 2 bus drivers required (\$56,454)
 - iv. Student time for travel (30-45 minutes/week).
 - v. **Total estimated cost: \$174,854 (on-going costs)**

Option 4: 5th Grade Start	
Pros (+)	Cons (-)
Maintains the 5th Grade start.	Bussing during the day means fewer busses for activity and field trips
Allows for homogenous groupings.	Doesn't fix scheduling issues at elementary buildings
Increases time on task for students.	AM/PM Bus Schedule
Facilities already available. No extra rooms needed.	Budget cuts may lead to more being placed on community partners.
Some of the 45-minute time could be used for student travel time, so students won't be pulled out of core class.	Extra 15 minutes for music classes, students could potentially lose class time. This could become an "unintentional pull-out" plan.
More instructional time (45 minutes).	Facility space
Easier transition for all stakeholders.	Who rides the bus with kids?
Parents like it better.	Increases FTE by 1.2.
Students receive one more, more effective, year of instrumental instruction versus a 6th grade start.	The bussing time may not be realistic, as students don't move as quickly as we'd like them to.

Specialty areas of teachers can be used more effectively.	No money saved for Music Administrator, or Summer Music.
Buses could end up costing nothing to the district.	HS/MS teachers may need compensation for time spent at elementaries.
	Increases General Music FTE by 0.28, without adding Summit.
	What if State stops funding busing?
	Lack of large rehearsal spaces at elementary.
	At-Risk students losing 45 minutes of instructional time.
	MS/HS teachers lose class time to go to elementaries. Who pays for subs?
	Teachers' travel time not resolved

5. Add-on for either option

- i. Summer music program to provide additional instructional time (4 teachers x 3 hours a day x 4 days a week x 4 weeks = \$8,320 for one session, \$16, 640 for two sessions).
- ii. Music administrator = \$120,000

RATIONALE FOR OPTION 3

Option 3 (6th Grade start) is the better option because it addresses many of the issues identified as weaknesses in our current system. The option addresses these issues:

- Improves quality of instrument instruction (homogeneous groups).
- Increases quality of time spent with instrumental music students.
- Increases general music time (all students in grade 5)
- Increases the promotion of instrumental music at the elementary level.
- Adds 84 hours to instrumental instructional time to beginning classes.
- Reduces one level of transition (potentially reducing losses in enrollment from beginning to intermediate program.
- Converts 0.67 (0.14 x 4.8 FTE = 0.67) of travel time into middle level instructional time.
- Supports K-5, 6-8, 9-12 space/grade configuration by moving instrumental music FTE with the students.
- Increases scheduling flexibility for elementary schedules.
- Adds music courses to middle school Fine/Performing Arts offerings.

EVALUATION

- Music attrition rate from beginning to intermediate instrumental music.
- % of students beginning instrumental music.
- Number of additional Fine and Performing Arts courses offered at middle level.

Appendix A: Instrumental Music Enrollment History

ORCHESTRA

Appendix A - Orchestra

Year =	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09
Grade =	5	5	5	6	6	6
ELEM.						
Bar Nunn	6	11	16	5	3	3
Cottonwood	15	10	22			
Crest Hill	14	18	12	11	5	5
Evansville	5	8	8			
FCA	3	4	10	2	4	0
Grant	9	5	20			
Manor Heights	14	10	20	8	5	4
MidWest						
Mills	3	1	6	4		
Mtn. View	3	6	9	7		
N. Casper	6	13	11			
Oregon Tr.	12	11	9	8	11	5
P.V.	21	32	24	3	15	6
Park	11	9	15	17	9	6
Pineview	12	17	9	7	4	
Poison Spider	11	4	13			
Sagewood	7	3	9	5	2	8
Southridge	9	21	17	13	8	8
Univ. Park	15	4	13			
Verda James	14	12	22	2	3	
Willard	10	16	11			
Woods L.C.	4	3	7			
Totals =	204	218	283	92	69	45
Ttl in Grade =	854	849	905	455	311	224
% in Orch.=	24%	26%	31%	20%	22%	20%

That grade not in this school=

'07 refers to the '07-'08 school year and so forth for '08 and '09

Year =	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09
Grade =	6	6	6	7	7	7	8	8	8	9	9	9
MIDDLE												
CCA	3	2	4	5	6	7	4	6	6	0	2	2
Centennial	11	6	16	19	13	7	10	11	11	5	4	3
CY	7	13	6	12	11	18	19	10	9	8	11	4
Dean Morgan	14	18	35	19	18	20	15	14	17	14	7	
Frontier	13	12	16	12	12	9	6	11	10			
Poison Spider	5	9	3	7	1	5	1	7	1			
Woods L.C.	4	4	2	2	3	4	5	2	3			
Totals =	57	64	82	76	64	70	60	61	57	27	24	9
Ttl in Grade =	422	546	622	922	860	861	889	935	877	605	509	459
% in Orch.=	14%	12%	13%	8%	7%	8%	7%	7%	6%	4%	5%	2%

Year =	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09
Grade =	9	9	9	10	10	10	11	11	11	12	12	12
HIGH SCH.												
KW	9	13	16	12	12	16	14	9	8	7	5	2
NC		5	14	21	13	12	10	19	5	14	5	4
Totals =	9	18	30	33	25	28	24	28	13	21	10	6
Ttl in Grade =	237	384	449	973	848	887	773	844	826	783	762	772
% in Orch.=	4%	5%	7%	3%	3%	3%	3%	3%	2%	3%	1%	1%

Year =	'07	'08	'09
Ttl 6th Orch.=	149	133	127
Ttl Grade 6 =	877	857	846
% in Orch.=	17%	16%	15%

Year =	'07	'08	'09
Ttl 9th Orch.=	36	42	39
Ttl 9th Grade=	842	893	908
% in Orch.=	4%	5%	4%

Year =	'08	'09	'08	'09	'08	'09	'08	'09	'08	'09	'08	'09
From/To =	5-6	5-6	6-7	6-7	7-8	7-8	8-9	8-9	9-10	9-10	10-11	10-11
# Change =	-71	-91	-85	-63	-15	-7	-18	-22	-11	-14	-14	-22
Attrition %s	35%	42%	57%	47%	20%	11%	30%	36%	31%	33%	58%	79%

Band

Appendix A - Band

Year =	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09
Grade =	5	5	5	6	6	6
ELEM.						
Bar Nunn	14	9	6	9	8	6
Cottonwood	23	10	22	7		
Crest Hill	30	18	31	21	5	6
Evansville	13	12	18			
FCA	9	13	15	10	8	3
Grant	13	5	7			
Manor Heights	21	20	19	11	11	10
MidWest	0	9	9	0	10	9
Mills	8	4	4	7		
Mtn. View	13	9	6	2		
N. Casper	10	13	10			
Oregon Tr.	15	24	22	8	13	8
P.V.	18	17	25	12	10	
Park	36	42	32	21	22	26
Pineview	16	13	18	5	7	
Poison Spider	6	17	11	4	4	
Sagewood	19	20	26	18	7	6
Southridge	17	14	18	18	9	6
Univ. Park	14	4	10	19	8	6
Verda James	30	29	31			
Willard	20	18	19			
Woods L.C.	9	3	11			
Totals =	354	323	370	172	122	86
Ttl in Grade =	854	849	905	455	311	224
% in Band =	41%	38%	41%	38%	39%	38%

That grade not in this school=

'07 refers to the '07-'08 school year and so forth for '08 and '09

Total Instr. Students	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09
	5	5	5	6	6	6
Total Instr. =	558	541	653	405	314	351
% of Grade=	65%	64%	72%	46%	37%	41%

Year =	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09
Grade =	6	6	6	7	7	7	8	8	8	9	9	9
MIDDLE												
CCA	3	2	9	9	6	19	14	6	6	12	2	5
Centennial	20	6	28	26	13	21	22	11	23	11	4	3
CY	8	13	26	39	11	33	45	10	15	19	11	15
Dean Morgan	27	18	37	28	18	32	24	14	31	17	7	
Frontier	15	11	15	27	12	10	19	11	12			
Poison Spider	2	5	11	3	1	5	3	7	1			
Woods L.C.	9	4	12	9	3	9	6	2	9			
Totals =	84	59	138	141	64	129	133	61	97	59	24	23
Ttl in Grade =	422	546	622	922	860	861	889	935	877	605	509	459
% in Band =	20%	11%	22%	15%	7%	15%	15%	7%	11%	10%	5%	5%

Year =	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09
Grade =	9	9	9	10	10	10	11	11	11	12	12	12
HIGH SCH.												
KW	13	13	21	18	12	25	21	9	12	13	5	8
NC		5	23	18	13	46	18	19	17	13	5	23
Totals =	13	18	44	36	25	71	39	28	29	26	10	31
Ttl in Grade =	237	384	449	973	848	887	773	844	826	783	762	772
% in Band =	5%	5%	10%	4%	3%	8%	5%	3%	4%	3%	1%	4%

Year =	'07	'08	'09
Ttl 6th Band =	256	181	224
Ttl Grade 6 =	877	857	846
% in Band =	29%	21%	26%

Year =	'07	'08	'09
Ttl 9th Band =	72	42	67
Ttl 9th Grade =	842	893	908
% in Band =	9%	5%	7%

Year =	'08	'09	'08	'09	'08	'09	'08	'09	'08	'09	'08	'09
From/To =	5-6	5-6	6-7	6-7	7-8	7-8	8-9	8-9	9-10	9-10	0-11	10-11
# Change =	-173	-99	-192	-52	-80	33	-91	6	-47	29	-29	3
Attrition %s	49%	31%	75%	29%	57%	-52%	68%	-10%	65%	-69%	74%	###

Total Instr. Continued	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09	'07	'08	'09
	7	7	7	8	8	8	9	9	9	10-12	10-12	10-12
Total Instr. =	217	128	199	193	122	154	108	84	106	179	126	178
% of Grade=	24%	15%	23%	22%	13%	18%	13%	9%	12%	7%	5%	7%


Appendix B

Music Advisory Committee

Adams, AmyElementary Instrumental Specialist
Clouser, TobyElementary Instrumental Specialist
Dunbar, ChristineMiddle School Orchestra
Foster, Vicki.....CSF Administrator
Lorimer, DeanOwner, Wyoming Music
Mathern, MarkC&I Associate Superintendent
Mueller, CrystalFacilitator
Nelson, CorinneElementary Instrumental Specialist
Paulson, GregMiddle School Band
Puryear, Marie.....Middle Level Principal
Reinsbach, Scott.....Middle School Band
Searcey, PaulSecondary Music Coordinator, Middle School Choir
Skatula, Kim.....Elementary Music Coordinator, General Music
Skatula, RickElementary Principal
Stubson, SusanWyoming Arts Council, Parent Representative
Waddell, DorisElementary Principal
Weis, Shawn.....High School Band
Weis, Amanda.....Middle School Band
Winckler, Kimi.....Employee, Hill Music; Casper Youth Orchestra
Wise, AudreyElementary Instrumental Specialist
Yarger, Louise.....Parent Representative

Appendix C

From:  Communication Team

Thursday, March 06, 2008 4:40:32 PM 

Subject: NCSD News: Music future search reaches consensus, moves forward with implementati

To:  Media  Staff Bulletin Board

For immediate release

Contact: Dr.

Emily King

March 6, 2008

Phone: 577-0244

Music future search reaches consensus, moves forward with implementation

A group of district staff and community members have been working for the past several months to solve the issue of the future of the Natrona County School District instrumental music program. The issue stems from the need to restructure instrumental music at the elementary level, due to the fact that more sixth-graders are moving into middle schools, while more ninth-graders are moving into the high school level.

Recently, the group proposed a solution to the problem, which considered the following issues: At what grade does instrumental music begin, and what does the delivery of music look like at each level after that?

The proposal consists of two phases, on which the group came to consensus.

Phase I

General

* All elementary students (kindergarten and older) will attend general music with their grade level classes.

* In one year (or by a specific date, which is yet to be determined), the district will commit to establishing a minimum number of elementary students in band and orchestra classes, as well as a timeline for implementation.

* The group hopes to create a district music administrator position. The group will begin to develop this position, as well as find a funding source. A recommendation will be made by the finance committee.

* The funding source for the position will be developed for the summer music program, which will begin in the summer of 2009.

* Elementary instrumental classes will be staffed with elementary instrumental music teachers, not secondary music teachers.

* Elementary instrumental music teachers will teach differentiated instrumental instruction and/or music for life classes as a pilot program at the middle level schools (which are those schools that mutually agree to participate in the pilot program).

* Elementary instrumental music will be offered as a pull-out program to students in the top grade in each elementary school.

Schedule

* Elementary instrumental music will be offered on a six-day rotation schedule,

with two 45-minute classes per each six-day rotation.

- * All elementary instrumental music classes will be scheduled during the morning (9 to 9:45 a.m.) or afternoon (2:45 to 3:30 p.m.) timeframe.

- * Elementary schools starting at 8:30 a.m. will have instrumental music at the end of their school day.

Phase II: (2009-10)

General

- * Elementary instrumental music teachers will teach beginning band/strings and/or music for life classes (guitar, piano lab, music technology, etc.) in the middle school program to accommodate students.

- * Elementary instrumental music teachers will be available to middle level schools for differentiation and music for life classes during the school day, outside of their elementary obligations.

- * A summer music program will be offered in the summer of 2009.

Fort Caspar Academy, Park Elementary and Woods schools are not part of the proposal, as schedules, entry points and grade level participation has been previously determined through the board of trustees approval process. These schools will continue with their current elementary instrumental music schedules.

This proposal must first be approved by the NCSD Human Resources and Curriculum & Instruction subcommittees. After approval from these two groups, the proposal will be presented to the board of trustees for final approval.

For more information, contact Dr. Emily King at 577-0244 or Emily_King@ncsd.k12.wy.us.